

---

## The Art of Passing down the Art: On The Blue Cliff Records and Haruchika Noguchi's Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records

Yosuke HIROTA\*

Keywords: The Blue Cliff Records, Haruchika Noguchi, Seitai, Zen

---

### Explanatory Note

In this paper, I analyze the art of the dialogue from the text titled *Hekigan Tokoro Dokoro [Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records]* by Haruchika Noguchi (野口晴哉, 1911-1976), the founder of Japanese bodywork methods, 'Seitai.' The text was based on the Zen question-and-answer book *Hekiganroku* (碧巖録[The Blue Cliff Records]), which has been read since the Song Dynasty in China and passed down to the present, interpreted in so many ways by many generations. I attempt to recount the art which is commonly found in Zen dialogue and Noguchi's 'Seitai' and is difficult to deal with in academic and scientific methods, as a practice of passing down the art. The Japanese version of this paper was published as the research note "*Hekiganroku oyobi Noguchi Haruchika Hekigan Tokoro Dokoro —Waza wo Tsutaeru Waza [On The Blue Cliff Records and Haruchika Noguchi's Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records —The Art of Passing down the Art]*" in Suzuki, S. eds *The bulletin of the Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research by Japan Society for the Promotion of Science: The Text Analyze of 'Case' through the Educational Poetics* (2003).

### Introduction

Here I will decipher some parts of *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* (『碧巖ところどころ』), a collection of manuscripts which Haruchika Noguchi (野口晴哉, 1911-1976) wrote about the Chinese Zen classic text, *The Blue Cliff Records*, between 1942 and 1949. *The Blue Cliff Records* (『碧巖録』) is a long-read Zen text from the Song Dynasty in China. Noguchi was known as an outstanding manipulative therapist in the 1920s, nevertheless he gave up the mindset and techniques for curing patients and then set out to change people's view of their bodies and their health.

It should be noted that this paper is neither an attempt to analyze the long-standing Zen book of questions and answers, *The Blue Cliff Records* itself, nor Noguchi's 'Seitai' (整体) body work. *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* is neither far removed from the original *The Blue Cliff Records* nor inseparable from Noguchi's 'Seitai'. Rather, I believe that *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* is not merely a point where shadows of the original *The Blue Cliff Records* and Noguchi's 'Seitai' meet, but a point which reflects back on *The Blue Cliff Records* and 'Seitai' itself. This idea first led me to *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records*.

In this paper, I do not interpret *The Blue Cliff Records*. Taking into account its bibliographic origins and background, I cannot understand Noguchi's art of 'Seitai' technically nor write about its technique. Thus, the limitations of my ability determine the direction of this paper. However, I wonder if the thoughts of Zen and the arts and ideas of Noguchi can be understood by restorative methods, such as quoting important passages from books and clearly explaining their concepts.

About this skepticism, I need to reflect on science and research methods. So far, there have been many specific

---

\* Professor, Graduate School of Literature and Human Sciences, Osaka Metropolitan University  
E-mail: y-hirota@omu.ac.jp

methodological attempts to interpret the sermon narratives in Zen and other religious texts, and accounts of various practical skills. These attempts include the analysis of fascinating texts and of voices collected through fieldwork.

Academic researchers have been concerned not merely with the analysis of subjects that can be understood objectively, but also with the analysis of those that cannot be captured within an objective framework. Even when some certain orders cannot be found, other ones could be captured by shedding light on them from different perspectives. What has been, and still seems to be aimed at, is to reconstruct fascinating objects and to receive some knowledge through academic restoration work that follows certain procedures in the methods of academic research.

The readers of this paper may then consider my attempt as follows: I would aim to understand the dialogue discourses like Zen that cannot be grasped by the conventional communicational theory that emphasizes consistency of meaning, or the practice of 'Seitai' that upends the common-sense view of the body supported by modern medicine and physiology, by shedding light on them from different angles and reading the intrinsic logic in them, and receiving some useful suggestions that are beneficial to current academic researches and science.

However, I do not think that the Zen dialogue which has been a topic of discussion for centuries or Noguchi's highly sophisticated 'Seitai' arts are available to us in the form prescribed by current academic research and science. And even if we do receive something from them, I suspect that they may be something other than what the practices were originally. And I have the most serious doubt as to the scientific research attitude that places Zen questions and "Seitai" themselves outside of the realm of study and science in the first place, and then tries to retrieve them again and transform them into something understandable inside the realm.

It is illustrated in the following words of Michel de Certeau (1925-1986) that these skepticisms are not just my prejudice.

'Of the practices themselves, science will retain only movable elements (tools and products to be put in display cases) or descriptive schemes (quantifiable behaviors, stereotypes of the staging of social intercourse, ritual structures), leaving aside the aspects of a society that cannot be so uprooted and transferred to another space: ways of using things or words according to circumstances' (Certeau 1984: 20)

Certeau's words, I believe, indicate an art of contact with what he calls 'practice.' Certeau reflects that attempts to overcome conventional research and science have pushed such practices into the "display case" or "schema" that such attempts prepared beforehand. What matters for Certeau's and my attempts is not the object made observable in such prepared practices but the place in which that object is at work. What matters here is the place expressed by Certeau as 'ways of using things or words according to circumstances' or 'the operations of speakers in particular situations of time, place, and competition' (Certeau 1984: 20). And I think what Certeau addresses corresponds to 'opportunity (機Ki)' or 'interval (間Ma)', on which Noguchi gave emphasis in the 'Seitai.'

With doubts toward the methodology of academic research and science in which my thinking has its roots, I read *The Blue Cliff Records* and Noguchi's *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* in this paper. However, the reason why I address them here is not because I want to praise the genealogy of Eastern thought as the antithesis of Western modernity. Rather, it is because in those texts there emerges an art of struggle between the scientific mode of thought on which modern people depend and the other mode of it on which they seek to escape from the former. The issue for this paper, therefore, is not the dichotomy between East and West, or pre-modern and modern, but the art of texts that makes various use of techniques to present the contents. They are the techniques, created as a whole with *The Blue Cliff Records*, composed by several authors using complicated rhetoric and contradictory contents.

The following are explanations of the chapters. I begin with the process of construction of and an overview of *The Blue Cliff Records* (Sec. 1). Then, considering the history of reception of *The Blue Cliff Records* and its influence up to the present (Sec. 2), I look into the overview of Noguchi's work and his text (Sec. 3,4).

### **(1) On *The Blue Cliff Records***

*The Blue Cliff Records* is an anthology of lectures by Yuan Wu Keqin (園悟克勤, 1063-1135) on the collection of classic writings of the Song dynasty, *100 Verses on Old Cases*, selected by Xue Dou Chongxian (雪竇重顯,

980-1052)<sup>1</sup>.

*100 Verses on Old Cases* is composed of a hundred records on sayings and behaviors of the major Zen masters of the Tang dynasty ('Case') which Xue Dou selected and to which he added 'Verse' with 'expressions that contain inflected metaphors'<sup>2</sup>. Yuan Wu's lectures on *100 Verses on Old Cases* were transcribed by several of his disciples and compiled into *The Blue Cliff Records*. The name 'Blue Cliff' is said to have been derived from the calligraphy displayed at the temple where Yuan Wu lived.

The 'Pointer' is the introductory remarks made by Yuan Wu in his lectures. At the end of each 'Case' and 'Verse', explanations by Yuan Wu, called 'Commentary,' are added, and each 'Case' is closed.

Not every 'Case' is marked with a 'Pointer'. The length of a 'Pointer' varies. Let us take "Third Case: Master Ma is Unwell" as an example of a typical 'Case' and trace its procedure.

Third Case: Master Ma is Unwell

'Pointer'

One device, one object; one word, one phrase – the intent is that you'll have a place to enter; still this is gouging a wound in healthy flesh—it can become a nest or a den. The great Function appears without abiding by fixed principles—the intent is that you'll realize there is something transcendental; it covers the sky and covers the earth, yet it cannot be grasped.

This way will do, not this way will do too—this is too diffuse. This way won't do, not this way won't do either—this is too cut off. Without treading these two paths, what would be right? Please test; I cite this for you to see: (Cleary, Cleary 2005: 18)

The 'Pointer' presents the ideal of Zen state. This indicates that one can behave in a 'correct' manner without being bound by any rules, that is, 'This way won't do, not this way won't do either.' However, as the question 'what would be right?' suggests, understanding this literally is not the way to reach the Zen state. For this reason, the Case is followed and explained further by the 'Commentary' with which Yuan Wu, the author of this part, introduces the readers into the following sections, with words such as 'Please test; I cite this for you to see.'

'Case'

Great Master Ma was unwell. [This fellow has broken down quite a bit. He's dragging in other people.] The temple superintendent asked him, "Teacher, how has your venerable health been in recent days?" [Four hundred and four diseases break out all at once. They'll be lucky if they're not seeing off a dead monk in three days. (This question)<sup>3</sup> is in the course of humanity and righteousness.] The Great Master said, "Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha." [How fresh and new! Sustenance for his fledgling.] (P. 18)

Great Master Ma is Zen Master Ma Tsu Daoyi (709-786). This 'Case' is an anecdote of his dialogue with the temple superintendent shortly before his death from illness. When the superintendent asked about Master Ma's health, Ma replied, 'Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha.' Sun Face Buddha is a Buddha with a long life span of 1,800 years, while Moon Face Buddha is a Buddha with a short life span of one day and one night. Yuan Wu's Note is attached to 'Cases' in [ ]. Commenting on this contradictory response, Yuan Wu wrote in his Note, 'How fresh and new! Sustenance for his fledgling.'

'Commentary'

The Great Master Ma was unwell, so the temple superintendent asked him, "Teacher, how has your venerable health been in recent days?" The Great Master replied, "Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha." If the patriarchal

1. In the Section (1), I outline *The Blue Cliff Records*, especially based on to Iriya's 'Commentary' (Iriya 1992) and other sources.

2. (Iriya 1992:4)

3. ( ) is the complement by the English translators. The following ( ) in *Blue Cliff Records* is same.

teachers had not dealt with others on the basis of the fundamental matter, how could we have the shining light of this Path? If you know what this public case comes down to, then you walk alone through the red sky; if you don't know where it comes down, time and again you'll lose the way before the withered tree cliff. (...) This "Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha" is extremely difficult to see; even Xue Dou finds it difficult to versify this. But since he has seen all the way through, he uses his life's work to the full to make his comment. Do you people want to see Xue Dou? Look at the text below. (P. 18-19)

Yuan Wu begins this 'Commentary' by using the first description of the 'Case'. He then searches the function of the punch line. However, 'Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha' is extremely difficult to understand and Yuan Wu states that understanding this phrase requires further descriptions of Xue Dou, and proceeds to 'Verse', which is followed by another 'Commentary' by Yuan Wu to close this 'Case'.

'Verse'

Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha. [When he opens his mouth you see his guts. (Ma and Xue Dou) are like two facing mirrors; in between there's no image or reflection.]

What kind of people were the Ancient Emperors? [Too lofty. Don't belittle them. They can be valued high or low.]

For twenty years I have suffered bitterly. [This is your own fall into the weeds- it's none of my business. Here's a mute eating a bitter melon.]

How many times I have gone down into the Blue Dragon's cave for you! [How was it worth this? Don't misuse your mind. Don't say there isn't anything extraordinary here.]

(...) (P. 19-20)

'Commentary'

When (the Sung Emperor) Shen Tsung was on the throne (1068-1085) he thought that this verse ridiculed the state, so he wouldn't let it be included in the (Buddhist) canon.

First Xue Dou quotes: "Sun Face Buddha, Moon Face Buddha." (...) (P. 20)

## (2) On reading *The Blue Cliff Records*

*The Blue Cliff Records* was composed by Yuan Wu, as follows: Xue Dou edited 100 Verses on Old Cases from the Recorded Sayings of Tang dynasty Zen masters, Yuan Wu again annotated and commented on it to create *The Blue Cliff Records*. This multi-layered structure confounds many of us, because we are accustomed to books with authors as the bearers of responsibility for their writing.

This book was considered a textbook or instructional text on Zen Buddhism (Iriya 1992: 3). During the Song dynasty, Zen spread to the common intellectuals as well as the bureaucrats. The number of lay followers increased, and such textbooks as *The Blue Cliff Records* were needed.

This textbook had tremendous influence. It is said that a Zen master in later times under Yuan Wu collected and burned the published books of *The Blue Cliff Records* because his students had become obsessed with Yuan Wu's writings. However, one current researcher of *The Blue Cliff Records* thinks that the power of this text lies in its being more than just a textbook.

'Note is essentially a condensed expression of Yuan Wu's unique insights. Yuan Wu often attempts to criticize the contents of the main theme, sometimes to reverse the situation. Xue Dou also sometimes tries to do so in some *Cases*, breaking the dogmatic style of the textbook, while at the same time destroying the passive attitude that students tend to adopt.' (Iriya 1992: 6-7)

Such a state of text does not suggest that the readers of this book should simply read the unequivocal meaning of the Zen questions of each 'Case', but rather the readers are always placed in the middle of the struggles between the commentaries. The struggles mean the conflict between Xue Dou's acceptance of and confrontation with the pre-

decessors and that between Yuan Wu's acceptance of and confrontation with the predecessors, including Xue Dou. There is a structure in the book which forces the readers to read the relationships between the editors themselves. Noguchi, one reader of the book, described the book as 'edited in three dimensions' (Noguchi 1981:ii)<sup>4</sup>.

Now, whether the readers read the book as a textbook or something that breaks the style of a textbook, *The Blue Cliff Records* include 100 case studies of Zen questions and answers. It is a text as 'case studies' that always flows in accordance with the circumstances. However it contains multiple perspectives with regards to how to read the cases. In other words, I find them 'cases that read cases'. Hence, Xue Dou and Yuan Wu are authors of 'Cases' who read 'Cases' and then re-edit and re-write them. And Noguchi's book, although independent of *The Blue Cliff Records*, is also a 'case study' that originates from the book.

*The Blue Cliff Records* is a book composed of a chain of texts, a book that involves those who come into contact with it in its chain. Thus, it means not only the original work but also a text that has been successively written since the Song Dynasty and continues to be written in the minds of the readers who read and interpret it up to today.

Now, I would like to introduce the condition of reception and research of *The Blue Cliff Records* in Japan. Although there are no commentaries on *The Blue Cliff Records* in China or Korea, an extremely large number of commentaries on it have been written in Japan since its transmission by Jyomyo Nampo (1235-1308) (Sueki 1996:299). Although I do not have direct access to the original materials of *The Blue Cliff Records* or to the genealogy of commentaries and academic researches on it published from the Kamakura period up to the present (Sueki 1996), I would like to note that annotations have been continuously added to the texts that were originally generated as annotations of annotations.

Here, I would like to mention the commentary by Sogen Omori for comparison with Noguchi's book. For Omori is a monk and heir to a certain school of Japanese swordsmanship (Omori 1976). Referring to his commentary, it should also be noted that his style of writing the entire 100 'Cases', sometimes solemnly and sometimes lightly, based on the narrative style of his lectures, is not limited to him, but is one of the common styles used when discussing *The Blue Cliff Records*.

Furthermore, an overview of the reception of Zen and *The Blue Cliff Records* into Japanese modern thought shows the influence of Zen Buddhism on the Kyoto School, represented by Kitaro Nishida (1870-1945) and Keiji Nishitani (1900-1990). The spirituality studies of Daisetsu Suzuki (1870-1966) also focus on Zen Buddhism. It is another interesting fact that Tomeri Tanimoto (1867-1946), who was a professor of pedagogy at Kyoto University in the same period as Nishida, studied *The Blue Cliff Records* and donated several commentaries and other research materials to the Kyoto University Library. *The Blue Cliff Records* has also been accepted not only in Japan but also by German philosophers (Kummel and Yoshimura 2000).

Referring to this theme in wider perspective, I would like to mention Kogaku Arifuku's *The Mind of Shohogenzo* (Arifuku 1994), which discusses the relationship between Zen Buddhism and philosophy. In this work, Arifuku, who is both a philosopher and a Zen Buddhist monk, attempts to read the 'Dropping off Body and Mind (身心脱落 Shin-Shin-Datsuraku)' in Dogen's (道元 1200-1253) classic Zen text *Shohogenzo* (『正法眼藏』) in the context of the body-mind dualism in Western philosophy. Another unique attempt to read Dogen from the thought of Jacques Derrida is Kazuo Morimoto's *From Derrida to Dogen* (Morimoto 1999). Such attempts to read Zen Buddhism from French post-structuralism are not uncommon, and Sueki also suggests reading *The Blue Cliff Records* from the perspective of Julia Kristeva's 'deconstruction of signs' (Sueki 1996:309). It should be noted, however, that the criticism of conventional scientific research stated at the beginning of this paper can be applied to each study.

### (3) On Haruchika Noguchi and his 'Seitai'

In recent years, Noguchi's unique view of life and death or humanity has been expanding beyond the framework of the Seitai Association he created<sup>5</sup>. What he called 'Seitai' was not something that had the purpose of cur-

4. Noguchi's *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* was partly translated into English in the Journal *Gekkan Zensei*. This part had no English translation and so I translated it.

5. Tetsu Nagasawa wrote a philosophical interpretation of Noguchi's concept of "Seitai" (Nagasawa 2002). And Noguchi's writing *Seitai Nyumon* (*Introduction to Seitai*) (Noguchi 2002f) and *Kaze no Koyo* [*Colds and Their Benefits*] (Noguchi 2003) were both republished in paperback.)

ing illness or maintaining health, but was an activity that transforms the very idea of human life and death. His techniques and philosophy were based on traditional Japanese and Chinese therapies, and the Western psychology and physiology that were introduced to Japan in his era, but there were insights about the movement of life that transcends all bodily mechanisms.

Now, his book, *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records*, was edited and published in 1981, five years after his death, by Zenseisya, a company Noguchi started himself to publish books on 'Seitai'. The book consisted of essays written between 1942 and 1949. *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* is unique among his Seitai books which mainly discuss Seitai's view of the body and his techniques, because it is the annotation of the other writings<sup>6</sup>.

Here putting Noguchi's book aside, I show how the relation of Zen and the body has been addressed. Because of the enormous volume of the books and articles on this issue, I introduce only a few that are relatively new, but the trend has not changed much.

*Zen and the theory of the relationship between Body and Mind* (Kobayashi 2001), a collection of essays in the 1970s and 1990s, discussed the Zen Buddhist views of life, living, and practice in relation to various theories of the body in the East and West. *Zen and the Life Sciences* (Morinaga 1994) connects the view of the world and practice of Zen with the theory of life at the cutting edge of modern science: genes, evolution, chaos theory, and so on.

Toru Abo and Shogen Muno's *Immunology Question and Answer* (Abo and Muno 2002) also makes clear the connection between Zen practice and human health. In the book, Zen master Ekaku Hakuin (白隠慧鶴 1685-1768), who also wrote the notes for *The Blue Cliff Records*, mentioned the technique of meditation in *Idle Talk On a Night Boat* (『夜船閑話』) as a pioneer of immunity-enhancing medicine. The technique is based on the 'Zazen' technique, seated meditation to imagine melting an egg-like substance over the head and spreading it throughout the body, which is understood today as a self-hypnosis method and as the enhancement of an increase of lymphocytes and a well-balanced parasympathetic nervous system function (see *ibid.*, pp. 107-109).

Thus, the relationships between Zen and the body have been examined and practiced from various angles up to the present. However, the logic behind all of these approaches is, I believe, that they draw the experiential qualities of the state of mind and 'Chi (氣)' that are evoked by Zen into the realm of current academic research and science, and lay them out in relation to the latest scientific findings. In other words, the discourse on Zen and the body has sought to 'translate' the Zen view of life into the language of somatic theory, science, and medicine, which is more accessible to people today.

Based on this idea, I try to discover how Noguchi's text attempts to address *The Blue Cliff Records*. That's the major question here. First, I read a group of Noguchi's writings about Ma Tsu, which I also introduced in the overview of the flow of *The Blue Cliff Records*.

Long ago, there was a man who truly understood what we call the cultivation of life, and who lived in a healthy way as well. His name was Tao Yi, and he was a native of Szechuan. His family name was Ma. Of his physical appearance, it is said that his features were very strange. He moved forwards like a bull, and had the gaze of a tiger. When he stretched his tongue out, it covered his nose. A very distinctive feature was that on the sole of each foot he had the mark of a wheel, just as the Buddha had. (Noguchi 2002a: 1)

This text by Noguchi is neither a sequential commentary on all 100 'Cases' of *The Blue Cliff Records*, nor does it reveal the structure of the book as a whole. As its title ('Here and There') suggests, it is a book in which Noguchi wrote about his favorite sections and people as he sees fit. And it seems that the key persons featured in the text were those who fit his 'Seitai' style. Ma Tsu is described as 'a man who truly understood what we call the cultivation of life, and who lived in a healthy way as well.' However, the health described here is not health as we know it from the medical view, but from Noguchi's own<sup>7</sup>. It is a view of health and wellness that allows one to live one's life to the fullest in every situation, without being obsessed with or dependent on anything.

6. About 20 of Noguchi's original books are still published by Zensei-sha. Most of them are compiled from his lectures.

7. A summary of Noguchi's views on health and wellness in the style of academic research was shown in (Maekawa 1999).

There is a saying of his<sup>8</sup>: ‘Not knowing perplexity of mind or wrong thoughts, mastering cause, attesting effect, staying for countless aeons in *sunyata samadhi* (meditation on nothingness), which is to say you already have enlightenment even so, ‘satori’ accomplished, you are perplexed. These words are a direct expression of ‘Already mind, already Buddha’, as is the saying ‘If you pursue names and chase after the forms of things, delusions spring up unceasingly and you create various kinds of karma, but if in a single instantaneous thought you see into your own true self, your self in its entirety will have achieved Buddhahood.’

If — not realising that in essence they are healthy — human beings think only of curing the illness of the moment by means of various devices and techniques, they grow weaker and weaker, even as the illness grows better, in consequence of the anxiety that they may fall ill again, and apprehension about what may happen if their fear comes true.

Devices and techniques may be used again and again for countless aeons, but a true sense of safety will not come to the human breast. If, however, you recognise that illness is no unnatural phenomenon but the body’s effort to be natural amidst the unnatural lives that human beings lead; and if you see that the activity that brings about illness is a natural power that has been given to human beings, then the heart will be settled, and with each repetition of illness, you will become stronger and stronger. If you understand that there is an approach which thinks in terms of disease-causing agents and puts illness at the centre, whereas the cultivation of life is your concern and starts from you, you will realise that to hold fast to all sorts of shoulds and shouldn’ts, never releasing them, is to live in an unhealthy way.

‘Having mastered building up and annihilation, every instance is the working of the universe and every instance is the self. Except where truth is, there is nowhere to stand; where one is standing is already truth, and that is your own self.’

From these words, you can imagine Ma Tsu’s perspective on the cultivation of life. You may create principles of cultivating life, destroy them, let go of them — it doesn’t matter, it’s up to you. Clearly, his idea of cultivating life is expressed in the words: ‘It is the spirit of the ordinary that is the way.’

So it is not strange that he should have said, ‘What do we call the spirit of the ordinary? No creation, neither for nor against, neither taken up nor thrown away, neither impermanence nor permanence, nothing profane and nothing sacred, at this very moment walking, standing, sitting or lying down suiting your words to the capacity of the hearer — all these things are the way.’

From the beginning, he did not follow the path of compiling lists of rules and regulations — ‘Hygiene consists in such and such’, ‘The rules of health are such and such’... He said, ‘No practice, no sitting; that is the best Zen.’ He also said, ‘Since form is nothingness, life is no more than non-life.’ Since he said this, he must have mastered the way to be without his breathing’s being disturbed by the fact of death. Perhaps his tongue was too long to allow him to say that health lies in being in the world without your breathing’s being disturbed by objects or values<sup>9</sup>. (Noguchi 2002a: 1-2)

Health as Noguchi refers to it is not opposed to illness. He regards even ‘function to get sick’ as a ‘natural power given to human beings’ and focuses his ‘Seitai’ arts on how to cope with the process of illness (Noguchi 2003b). He also suggests that putting aside all kinds of ‘shoulds and shouldn’ts’ and trusting in one’s own power, in conjunction with Ma Tsu’s words, ‘all these things are the way.’

The cures and health which normal medicine defined were not of any interest to Noguchi. Instead, Noguchi’s view of wellness is ‘the way to be without his breathing’s being disturbed by the fact of death.’ However, he was also not a man who could remain in the image of an enlightened sage without saying anything. He described Ma Tsu by saying ‘his tongue was too long,’ and the way Ma Tsu would stick out his tongue and deny all the ‘shoulds and shouldn’ts’ of the world was also one of Noguchi’s specialties.

8. ‘His’ means ‘Ma Tsu’s.’ In this Noguchi’s text, the writings in the quotation (‘ ’) are also Ma Tsu’s sayings (Iriya 1984).

9. Note that the words in ‘ ‘ here are cited from Ma Tsu’s Sayings (Iriya 1984).

Great Master Ma often told people, 'Already mind, already Buddha'.

However assiduously you polish a roof-tile, it is not the kind of thing that can become a mirror. The mind in itself and as it is is Buddha. No doubt there were too many people sweating away with the intention of becoming a Buddha.

One monk asked, 'Why do you teach "Already mind, already Buddha"?'

Ma Tsu calmly replied, 'It is meant to quiet a child's crying' ---- that is to say, it is something to distract a child with.

But the monk wouldn't give up: 'And when the crying's stopped, what then?'

'No mind, no Buddha,' was the simple reply. There is no such thing as the mind and no such thing as the Buddha.

'He's making a fool of an adult here,' thought the monk suspiciously, and he asked yet another question: 'If not "Already mind, already Buddha" and if not "No mind, no Buddha", what then?'

What a lot of fuss this monk makes! Whatever's said, it's the same. From the beginning the human mouth is so made that it can say anything at all.

'No things,' said Ma Tsu.

The monk was satisfied and withdrew. As he watched the back of the retreating monk. Ma Tsu thought, 'I wonder if he understood "No things" ---- still, it's a new phrase and so it'll give him something to suck on for a while.'

Human beings are odd creatures. (Noguchi 2002b: 1)

'Already mind, already Buddha' is one of the typical Zen questions and answers, but it is not something that can be answered clearly by a question and answer. The monk also asks Ma Tsu, 'How do you preach "Already mind, already Buddha"?'<sup>10</sup> At one time, Ma Tsu answered, 'It is meant to quiet a child's crying' and at another time 'No mind, no Buddha.' If the monk asked him, 'If not "Already mind, already Buddha" and if not "No mind, no Buddha", what then?', he answered, 'No things.' Noguchi describes Ma Tsu, after answering in this way, he would then stick out his tongue and say, 'still, it's a new phrase and so it'll give him something to suck on for a while.'

Now I ask; how do these questions and answers relate to his 'Seitai'? This question is not easy to answer because Zen questions and answers deal with the mind and 'Seitai' deals with the body. The only thing that I can affirm is that Noguchi did not write *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* in an attempt to provide an ideological underpinning to his 'Seitai' arts. Rather, for him, reading *The Blue Cliff Records* and writing *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* were both 'Seitai' art and a search for what human beings are themselves.

One time I was talking to a woman who could not easily stand up and walk due to neuralgia. I often drop ashes while smoking, and at that time, some of the ashes I dropped fell on her clothes. She then quickly stood up, removed the ashes from her clothes, and sat down again without showing any surprise. Then I said, "You just stood up, didn't you?" She said, 'I stood up.' I said, 'You stood up. You couldn't stand a while ago. Why don't you stand up again?' She did stand up and walk. (Noguchi 1986: 143)

In this statement from his 'Seitai' lecture notes, he described the changes in women. His 'Seitai' art is not a structural manipulation of the body, such as 'putting the right hand on the third lumbar vertebra and letting the chi pass through...', but an event in which the direction of the mind is changed by a casual occurrence, such as 'opportunity' or 'interval.' Therefore, I believe that for Noguchi, each 'Case' of questions and answers in *The Blue Cliff Records* is the very occurrence of 'Seitai', and that he was practicing 'Seitai' as such.

#### **(4) On Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records**

Let us now read *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records*, contrasting it with *The Blue Cliff Records*. The subject of this paper is 'Case 53: Pai Chang's Wild Ducks,' which describes the exchange between Master Ma and his disciple Pai Chang. First, the anecdote in the original *The Blue Cliff Records* is as follows.

---

10. This question and answer is not from *The Blue Cliff Records*, but is a combination of several anecdotes from *Ma Tsu's Sayings*. (These anecdotes are also found in *Ma Tsu's Sayings* (Iriya 1984)).



‘Case’

Once when Great Master Ma and Pai Chang were walking together they saw some wild ducks fly by. The Great Master asked, “What is that?” Chang said, “Wild ducks.” The Great Master said, “Where have they gone?” Chang said, “They’ve flown away.” The Great Master then twisted Pai Chang’s nose. Chang cried out in pain. The Great Master said, “When have they ever flown away?” (Cleary and Cleary 2005: 309)

This ‘Case’ describes a conversation between Ma Tsu and his disciple Pai Chang when they saw wild ducks flying away. When Ma Tsu asked his disciple, ‘What is that?’, Pai Chang replies, ‘Wild ducks.’ When Ma Tsu then asks, ‘Where have they gone?’ Pai Chang replies, “They’ve flown away”. To this answer, Ma Tsu responds by twisting Pai Chang’s nose and saying, ‘When have they ever flown away?’ This exchange seemed unreasonable to Yuan Wu, who wrote in his ‘Commentary:’

If you observe this case with the correct eye, unexpectedly it’s Pai Chang who has the correct basis, whereas Great Master Ma is creating waves where there is no wind. If all of you want to be teachers of Buddhas and Patriarchs, then study Pai Chang. If you want to be unable to save even yourselves, then study the Great Master Ma. (...) (Cleary and Cleary 2005: 310)

Yuan Wu also attempts to clarify Ma’s intentions in his later writings, but immediately after this ‘Case’, he seems to be sympathetic to Pai Chang, whose nose was twisted for no reason at all. Yuan Wu says, ‘If you want to be unable to save even yourselves, then study the Great Master Ma.’

Noguchi portrays this conversation between Master Ma and Pai Chang as follows.

Pai Chang was accompanying Great Master Ma. A wild duck suddenly rose up and flew off.

“What was that?” asked Ma.

Whenever Pai Chang was ordered to do something, he would say ‘Yes’ and follow instructions to the letter. He was the picture of faithful service. So he always had a meek look about him, busied himself only with anticipating others’ wants, and was unable to say or do what he himself wanted at all. It seems as though he was absolutely terrified of making mistakes. Altogether, a very uninteresting man. What would he reply?

‘A wild duck.’

That’s it! That’s the answer I expected! Does he think I didn’t see that for myself! Why does he only tag along behind others? If somebody can say nothing because he doesn’t want to look a fool, then there’s still some sense there, but this fellow cannot even try not to look a fool. He’s a bumpkin.

‘Where has it gone?’

‘It’s flown away.’

How thick can you get?

He’s thicker than thick. He simply repeats what I have said.

And thinking ‘How long do I have to go on talking to myself?’, Ma Tsu seized Pai Chang’s nose and twisted it as hard as he could. Of course, Pai Chang couldn’t bear the pain...

Ah, that’s what his voice sounds like. It’s the first chance I’ve had of hearing it. As soon as Pai Chang’s spontaneous yell had ceased, Ma Tsu pressed him further: ‘When has it ever flown away?’

But Pai Chang only grimaced.

He’s like a wall, this fellow. Beat him and he’ll make a sound, but of himself he will not utter one word. What a brick wall! (Noguchi 2002b: 2)

Noguchi considers Pai Chang an uninteresting and boorish man who is always sensitive to others’ moods. He then describes the conversation between the master and the disciple in this graphic manner. Noguchi’s writing like this makes even the corresponding ‘Case’ of *The Blue Cliff Records* read the same way. Characteristically, in Noguchi’s interpretation, the growl of Pai Chang, whose nose was twisted, is found as “his voice.” Noguchi says, ‘of

himself he will not utter one word.’

This story is continued. Yuan Wu’s ‘Commentary’ describes the following story.

When Ma Tsu went up to the hall the next day, as soon as the congregation had assembled, Pai Chang came forward and rolled up the bowing mat. Ma Tsu immediately left his seat. After he had returned to his abbot’s quarters, he asked Pai Chang, “I had just gone up to the hall and had not yet preached; why did you roll up the mat right away?” Chang said, “Yesterday I had my nose twisted by you, Teacher, and it hurt.” Tsu said, “Where were you keeping your mind yesterday?” Chang said, “Today the nose no longer hurts.” Tsu said, “You have profound knowledge of Today’s affair.” (Cleary and Cleary 2005: 311)

How should this inexplicable behavior of Pai Chang and his response be interpreted? Noguchi writes on this in detail. Let’s take a look here.

The next day, when Ma Tsu had gone up to the hall and was about to preach to the assembled monks, Pai Chang stepped out quite brazenly and started to roll up the mat for bowing.

What’s this? Something odd is happening today. He’s started to do something I haven’t asked him to do! What on earth is the fellow up to?

And recalling what had happened the previous day, Ma Tsu, feeling rather intrigued, left the hall.

He seems to imitate Manjusti<sup>11</sup>. If that is so, am I the Buddha?

With a little smile on his face, Ma Tsu returned to his chambers. On the way, he bumped into Pai Chang.

Putting a slightly fierce expression on his face, he said, ‘Oy, why did you roll up the mat when I hadn’t even begun to preach?’

Paichang gave the calm reply, ‘Yesterday, when you twisted my nose, it was, if I may say so, very painful.’

Ma Tsu smiled a bit in spite of himself.

‘What was it that happened yesterday?’

‘Today,’ said Pai Chang, ‘my nose does not hurt.’

Even the nose of a fellow like this seems to have actually felt pain, and today he is actually using his own words when he talks.

‘The words are getting through... today.’

As Ma Tsu said this, a smile broke over his face. (Noguchi 2002c: 1)

As a ‘Bildungsroman’, Noguchi reads this conversation between Ma Tsu and Pai Chang. What is different from yesterday’s conversation about ducks is that today Pai Chang does not give a corresponding answer to Ma Tsu’s question. To Ma Tsu’s question as to why the mat was removed, Pai Chang responds that his nose was sore yesterday. To the question about yesterday, he responds that it does not hurt today. Yesterday, Pai Chang had answered Ma Tsu’s question exactly as Ma Tsu had asked. Today, however, he gives an answer that appears to be out of synchronization.

Noguchi found Pai Chang’s growl of yesterday as his own voice, but for today’s conversation Noguchi said, ‘He is actually using his own words when he talks.’ He added Ma Tsu’s murmur ‘The words are getting through... today,’ which is not found in *The Blue Cliff Records*. And Yuan Wu’s Commentary continues as follows.

Chang then bowed and returned to the attendants’ quarters, crying. One of his fellow attendants asked, “Why are you crying?” Chang said, “Go ask our Master.” The attendant then went to ask Ma Tsu. Tsu said, “Go ask Pai Chang.” When the attendant returned to their quarters to ask Pai Chang, Chang laughed loudly. The attendant said, “You were just crying-now why are you laughing?” Chang said, “I was crying before, now I’m laughing.” Look at Pai Chang after his enlightenment; turning smoothly, he can’t be trapped. Naturally he’s sparkling clear on all sides. (Cleary and

---

11. Manjusti is Bodhisattva(菩薩) who administers wisdom. His picture or statue is located next to Buddha as an attendant.

Cleary 2005: 311-312)

In this quotation, the dialogue between Ma Tsu and Pai Chang unfolds through an acolyte: when Pai Chang curtsies and returns to the dormitory where the acolyte lives, he is crying loudly there. Another acolyte worries about him, and asks why he is crying; then Pai Chang tells the acolyte to go to Ma Tsu to ask him the reason. Noguchi describes the following scene, adding words not found in the original text.

He knew that walls have ears, but that a wall should speak was unheard of. Perhaps it had something to do with the weather. Ma Tsu was in his room, still smiling broadly, when an acolyte entered with an odd expression on his face.

‘Master’ he said, ‘Pai Chang came back to the monks’ quarters and he began crying loudly. When one of us asked him why he was crying like that, he told us to go and ask the Master. May I ask why he’s crying so much?’

It’s as I thought. His crying, too, is his own voice. He must be hearing his voice for the first time, too. Since he’s crying, his nose must have hurt. It was a good thing it did. The more he cries, the better.

‘Go back again to the monks’ quarters and ask him how he feels.’

He’s putting on a grand show. What an odd fellow he is!

The acolyte at once told Pai Chang what Ma Tsu had said, and Pai Chang suddenly began laughing loudly. The acolyte went back again to Ma Tsu’s chambers.

‘I asked him why, when he had been crying, he was now laughing, and he said, “Hitherto I wept, henceforth I shall laugh. “And he started laughing again.”

It’s good that he should go on trying out various voices... his own voice is still new to him. It’s all because he is so pure-hearted.

And then Ma Tsu said quietly to the acolyte. ‘This time he has understood something that didn’t hurt, you see.’ (Noguchi 2002c: 1-2)

In contrast to Yuan Wu’s description of the acolyte’s simple going and returning, Noguchi also adds Ma’s commentary on Pai Chang’s strange behavior. Here again, Noguchi made Ma Tsu say, ‘Pai Chang ‘hears his voice’, commenting on Pai Chang’s behavior. When Ma Tsu twisted his nose yesterday, Pai Chang made his own voice as if the wall had been hit and made a sound, but today Ma Tsu says Pai Chang hears his voice himself.

To speak in ‘one’s own voice/word’ and to hear it oneself is a phrase that is often used when discussing autonomy in the context of philosophy and pedagogy. The dialogue between Ma Tsu and Pai Chang could also be discussed in this context. At the same time, his crying and laughing have been described as ‘a grand show’. To speak one’s own voice means to act according to one’s own desires without relying on others, while ‘show’ means to be aware of the eyes of others and to act in a way that surprises them. Noguchi, in a subsequent writing, describes Pai Chang’s state ‘after his enlightenment,’ which means ‘turning smoothly, he can’t be trapped. Naturally he’s sparkling clear on all sides.’

It was from this time that I, Pai Chang, who had felt anxious whenever I wanted to say something unless I decorated or painted my own words with suitable phrases culled from sutras and books, became able to live without quoting what some master had said in a sutra or book. Whenever I wanted to do something, I would surreptitiously see what others felt before making up my mind. When listening to music, too, I would keep in mind what some critic had written and would try to feel accordingly, and when I was asked what I felt, I could only say much the same as the review had said. Still, I felt that my acts and opinions were my own, but now I think of it, in all this there was nothing of myself.

‘From the time my nose was twisted, I was able to hear my own voice. Pai Chang is said to have told someone, recalling with affection Ma Tsu of the wild duck. ‘It was from that time that I began thinking with my own head, speaking with my own mouth, hearing with my own ears, and seeing with my own eyes.’ (Noguchi 2002c: 2)

Noguchi’s summary can be regarded as a modern interpretation of enlightenment. A person who is able to find his or her own judgment without being misled by authoritative books or information spread in society is an ideal

image of human development which is one of the goals of modern education.

What Noguchi wrote about Ma Tsu is also related to the historical situation during World War II. In a text written in 1944, he wrote as follows. The difficulty of speaking in one's own voice under such circumstances is understandable.

As for the future of Japan, there are those who advocate the preservation of the national polity, those who shout in favour of Communism, those who seek to bring about democracy, those who are frightened of inflation, and those who are on their guard against deflation, but nobody knows what is going to happen. Only the people who are able to stay composed amidst unknowing are able to act as the moment asks. (Noguchi 2003a: 2)

Thus, there are several other statements in Noguchi's writings that can be found to support the importance of 'speaking one's own words.' However, his description in *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* and the book *The Blue Cliff Records* are not to be interpreted simply as a story of Bildungsroman or a story of 'soul-searching.'

Noguchi makes Ma Tsu describe Pai Chang's behavior as 'Show.' Even though his own voice, his own pain, and his own laughter were real, Noguchi makes Ma Tsu say they were as if he was acting out as 'Show.' But the 'Show' is also not simply interpreted as a performance to gain an identity of 'self.'

Ma Tsu puts Pai Chang through another ordeal, and Noguchi cites an anecdote not included in *The Blue Cliff Records* that further illustrates the dialogue between master and disciple<sup>12</sup>.

When Pai-ching swanned into Ma Tsu's room, Ma Tsu at once seized his flywhisk and thrust it right in front of Pai Chang's face. But it was no longer the Pai Chang of old. He immediately asked, 'Do you cleave to this action, or do you disengage from it?'

Building up, or annihilation? Holding fast or letting go? Ma Tsu returned the fly-whisk to its original place in the corner of the chair and sat in silence.

As the time is, so are the means. I use it in every way possible, according to the person I am with. For me, there are no constraints. (Noguchi 2002d: 1)

Ma Tsu's behavior has always been abrupt. But Pai Chang now takes advantage of this behavior to ask, 'Do you cleave to this action, or do you disengage from it?' Ma Tsu, who posed the riddle of the broomstick in the first place, simply puts the broom back where it belonged.

Pai Chang's face must have shown that he had taken in everything, for Ma Tsu then asked, 'And after this, when you clash those lips of yours together, how will you help people?' (Noguchi 2002d: 1)

Pai Chang felt that he had already read Grand Master Ma's intentions. But then, Ma Tsu asked, suddenly 'And after this, when you clash those lips of yours together, how will you help people?'

Pai Chang took up the fly-whisk and abruptly held it up, just as Ma Tsu had done. Grinning within himself, Ma Tsu asked Pai Chang the same question: 'Do you cleave to this action, or do you disengage from it?' And Pai Chang just as Ma Tsu had done, replaced the flywhisk in the same corner of the chair. Whereupon, displaying all his authority, Ma Tsu gave the Zen shout of 'Ho!' It was the first such shout in Pai Chang's experience of Zen.

You copy cat! How will you respond to this? (Noguchi 2002d: 1)

Pai Chang then posed in the same way as Ma Tsu. Ma Tsu repeats Pai Chang's words in the same way. And as soon as Pai Chang tried the same behavior as Ma Tsu, Ma Tsu gave him a shout. 'It was the first such shout in Pai Chang's experience of Zen.'

Noguchi describes the implication of a shout with the words, 'You copy cat!' Pai Chang was convinced he was

---

12. This passage is cited from the *Pai Chang Pai Chang Sayings* (Iriya 1984:166).

acting his way in his own voice; Pai Chang did not repeat his master's words verbatim when he was in front of his master, but rather he thought he was speaking in his own voice, with a few differences. But now the master repeated his behavior. Then, instantly, he repeated the master's spur-of-the-moment behavior. That's when he was hit with a brilliant shout.

Was what Pai Chang thought was himself another person named 'Pai Chang'? Ma Tsu described Pai Chang's crying and laughing as 'Show'. Was the 'Show' still a fake? The answer to this question is not clear from Noguchi's description, and of course it is not something I can unambiguously conclude.

However, what is interesting to me is the following; the question of how to pass down enlightenment to others was the original theme of *The Blue Cliff Records*. It was also the issue for Noguchi, who had experienced 'Seitai' over the years, and for the Zen masters involved in the chain of texts *The Blue Cliff Records*. The challenge of this paper is also how to pass down this very obvious and very unlikely occurrence, that a person can change at the drop of a hat.

For example, everyone says that it is necessary to capture the 'opportunity' or that it is important to take advantage of the 'interval'. But there are no such things in those texts. I believe that both the predecessors and Noguchi warned their readers of this again and again. In the third 'Case' of the Master Ma's deathbed, the function of that 'opportunity,' which is 'This way won't do, not this way won't do either,' is described. However, it seems to be said that it is not something that appears in words or in concrete forms. Noguchi describes the scene as follows.

To a priest who came to enquire after his health and asked Ma Tsu how he was feeling, Ma Tsu replied. 'Sun-faced Buddha, Moon-faced Buddha.'

Not long afterwards, Ma Tsu left this world.

Each of his disciples chewed over his words. Even so great a master was suggesting that he didn't want to die, thought one. Another monk consulted the 'Buddha Name Sutra'<sup>13</sup> and found that the Buddha had no form and that in essence there is no life or death, and he concluded that the words meant that every living creature dies. Another said that the life-span of the Sun-faced Buddha was one thousand, eight hundred years whereas that of the Moon-faced Buddha was a night and a day, and so Ma Tsu was saying that his life was completed. There were all sorts of interpretations.

How long will you chase the tail of my words? (Noguchi 2002e: 1)

Finding one's own words in pursuit of the words of others. Such activities are always repelled and fail. 'How long will you chase the tail of my words?'

I find myself hearing such a voice from this text. It's not that there is not something in the meaning of the words. Everyone thinks the issue must lie somewhere else. This text constantly forces the reader to pay attention to something other than what is written. In doing so, the reader's mind suddenly changes direction. The reader then becomes aware of the 'Show' that was making him into 'the one'. The issue in the first place is switched at the moment. The reader no longer knows what was 'one's own words' and what was 'someone else's words.' However, there is a textual activity here that constantly engages the reader in a new textual struggle between words. I believe this is what the ancient Zen monks and Noguchi were doing.

The 'opportunity' and the 'interval' are temporal things that are easily lost in the space of the text. *The Blue Cliff Records* and Noguchi's *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* are attempts to make the reader discover them. I believe that what they were trying to pass down was the one-time and one-off art of conveying the 'opportunity' and 'interval'.

The text, *The Blue Cliff Records* and *Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records* is someone's own voice as well as the voice of others at the same time. Someone passes down what the forerunner left behind, which again the successor passes down. The words of others are passed down to future generations. The question that has long been raised is how to speak one's own words in this chain of texts.

13. 'Buddha(s) Name(s) Sutra' was the name of an influential Sutra translated into Chinese around 520 by Bodhiruchi.

However, the focus was not about words having a singularly fixed meaning and understanding, whether they were the words of others or one's own words. The issue was how the reception of these words will be 'shifted', that is, how the words move by themselves, and how they resonate in the shift with something moving in the person who receives the texts. Such questions, I believe, are what can be learned in the act of reading Zen and 'Seitai' texts.

## Reference

### -The Blue Cliff Records

- The English version which I cite is the following:

Cleary, Th and Cleary, J. C., (trans.) (2005) *The Blue Cliff Records*, Shambhala (*The first edition: 1977*)

- The Japanese version which I refer to is the following:

Iriya, Y et al. eds. (1992-1996), *Hekiganroku [The Blue Cliff Records]*, vol 1-3, Iwanami Syoten

Sueki, F eds., Research Group of *The Blue Cliff Records* trans. (2001-2003), *Gendaigoyaku Hekiganroku [Modern translation of The Blue Cliff Records]*, vol 1-3, Iwanami Syoten

### -Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records

- Japanese original:

Noguchi, H. (1981), *Hekigan Tokorodokoro [Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records]*, Zenseisha

- English Translations which are quoted\*:

Noguchi, H. (2002a), "Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records(III)", in *Gekkan Zensei [Monthly Zensei]* Vol 460, June, 2002, Zenseisha

Noguchi, H. (2002b), "Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records(IV)", in *Gekkan Zensei [Monthly Zensei]* Vol 461, July, 2002, Zenseisha

Noguchi, H. (2002c), "Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records(V)", in *Gekkan Zensei [Monthly Zensei]* Vol 462, August, 2002, Zenseisha

Noguchi, H. (2002d), "Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records(VI)", in *Gekkan Zensei [Monthly Zensei]* Vol 463, September, 2002, Zenseisha

Noguchi, H. (2003a), "Here and There in The Blue Cliff Records(XIII)", in *Gekkan Zensei [Monthly Zensei]* Vol 470, April, 2003, Zenseisha

\*The Name of the translator was not indicated in the journals.

### Other books and papers

Abo, T. and Munro, S. (2002), *Menekigaku Montou [Immunology Question and Answer]*, Kawade Shobo Shinsha

Arifuku, A. (1994), "*Syohogenzo*" no Kokoro [*The Mind of Shohogenzo*], Nihon Hoso Shuppan Kyokai

Certeau, M. de (1984), Rendall, S. (trans.), *The Practice of Everyday Life*, University of California Press

Iriya, Y. eds. (1984) *Ma Tsu no Goroku [Ma Tsu's Sayings]*, Institute for Zen Studies, 1984

Iriya, Y. (1992), "Kaisetsu [Commentary]" in Iriya et al. eds., *The Blue Cliff Records vol 1*)

Kobayashi, E. eds. (2001), *Zen to Nihon Bunka 7: Zen to Shin-Shin Ron [Zen and Japanese Culture 7: Zen and the theory of the relationship between Body and Mind]*, Perikansha

Soko Morinaga eds. (1994), *Zen to Seimei Kagaku [Zen and the Life Sciences]*, Kinokuniya Shoten

Kummel, F. (2000), Yoshimura, F. (trans.), "Risetsuteki Kozo ni okeru Ningen no Basyo [The Place of Man in the Adjacent

- Structure],” in Shitahodo, Y. and the Society for Educational Anthropology, *Kyouikuningengaku no Konponmondai [Fundamental Problems of Educational Anthropology]*, Togeisha
- Maekawa, R. (1999), “Chi Noguchi Haruchika to ‘Zensei’ Shiso [Chi: Noguchi Haruchika and ‘Zensei’ Thought]” in Tanabe, S. et al eds, *Iyashi wo Ikita Hitobito [People Who Lived Healing: Alternatives to Modern Knowledge]*, Senshu University Press
- Morimoto, K. (1999), *Derrida kara Dogen he [From Derrida to Dogen]*, Chikuma Syobo
- Nagasawa, T. (2002), *Yasei no Shiko [Wild Thought]*, Seidosha
- Noguchi, H. (1986a), *‘Yuki’ Ho I [The ‘Yuki’ Method I]*, Zenseisha
- Noguchi, H. (2002f), *Seitai Nyumon [Introduction to Seitai]*, Chikuma Syobo
- Noguchi, H. (2003b), *Kaze no Kouyou [Colds and Their Benefits]*, Chikuma syobo
- Omori, S. (1976), *Hekiganroku [The Blue Cliff Records]* vol.1,2, Hakujyusya
- Sueki, F. (1996), “ ‘Hekiganroku’ wo Yomutameni [To Read ‘The Blue Cliff Records]”, in Iriya et al. eds., *Hekiganroku [The Blue Cliff Records]*, vol. 3, Iwanami Syoten